

City of Santa Barbara

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES OCTOBER 7, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*Bob Cunningham
Ivan Insua
Leon A. Olson
Richard Six
David R. Watkins

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Moore.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Moore, Cunningham (absent 3:15 - 3:22 p.m., 3:53 - 6:36 p.m.),

Insua, Olson (absent 3:26 - 3:53 p.m.), Six, and Watkins (at 3:09

p.m.)

Members absent: None

Staff present: Ostrenger, Unzueta (at 6:35 p.m.), Ozyilmaz, and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **September**

23, 2019, as submitted.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 5/0/0. (Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 30, 2019, as reviewed by Board

Members Cunningham and Six.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 7, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members

Six, Cunningham, and Watkins.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
 - 1. Mr. Ozyilmaz announced the following:
 - a. As of Tuesday, October 1, 2019, all project applicants must provide an electronic copy of their plans either as a pdf attachment to an e-mail or submitted on a portable electronic storage device (such as a CD or similar device). The electronic plans will be available to view on the City's website at the same time the agenda is available online. The new submittal requirements apply to the following review bodies: Architectural Board of Review, Historic Landmarks Commission, Single Family Design Board, Planning Commission, and Staff Hearing Officer.
 - a. Item 3, 219 E. Haley St. has been postponed two weeks due to an error in the project description.
 - b. Board member Cunningham will be recusing himself from hearing Item 1, 400 Blk Old Coast Hwy and Item 4, 1964 Las Canoas Rd.
 - c. A memorandum was sent to the Board regarding changes to state law which affects the design of sidewalk access ramps City-wide.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Board member Six reported that the awards of design excellence sub-committee, comprised of Historic Landmarks Commission, Architectural Board of Review, and the Single Family Design Board members had met and discussed what kind of plaque to use for the design awards.

(3:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

1. 400 BLK OLD COAST HWY

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-798
Application Number: PLN2019-00410
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Eric Goodall

(Proposal for parkway hardscaping. Project proposes to infill the existing planters with buff colored permeable pavers. No changes to the newly constructed sidewalk are proposed.)

Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis. Project was last reviewed on Consent on September 3, 2019.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contract work with the City of Santa Barbara.

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Eric Goodall, Applicant, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

- 1. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. Without any information to the contrary from Staff, the project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City, given the fairly standard theme of parkways in this area and configuration.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project, as it is mostly flatscape.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood, as it is flatscape.
 - d. There are no adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. There are no established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space.

Action: Six/Olson, 5/0/0. (Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

(3:35PM) FINAL APPROVAL

101 S CANADA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-231-016

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PLN2016-00536
Owner: Edward St. George
Applicant: On Design LLC

(Proposal for three condominium units. Project consists of the construction of a 4,176 square foot, two-story duplex and a 631 square foot three-car garage on a 13,153 square foot lot. The existing 1,046 square foot single-family residence would remain, and would be remodeled to include a 754 square foot second-story addition above a new 457 square foot two-car garage, and one-car carport. The development on site will be 7,064 square feet with a residential density of 10 dwelling units per acre on an R-2 (Two-Unit Residential) zoned lot with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium Density Residential (max 12 du/acre. There will be 525 cubic yards of grading excavation and 635 cubic yards of fill dirt. Also proposed is the demolition of two unpermitted sheds and a two-car garage. This proposal will address violations identified in Enforcement Case ENF2016-01675.)

Final Approval is requested. Project plans require substantial conformance with the plans granted Project Design Approval on September 23, 2019.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Olson recused himself from hearing this item due to his inability to be objective during the review of the project.

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Noah Greer, Applicant, On Design LLC; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect, Earthform

Design; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1. The color of all the metal flashing at the wood trim shall be factory finish and match the wood trim color.
- 2. All metal flashing at the window perimeters shall have a paint color to match the window sash color.
- 3. Provide ten *juncus patens* plants to screen the backflow preventer.
- 4. Reduce the range of roof tiles color by eliminating the darkest tone.
- 5. When Applicant returns, have all plaster shapes, eaves, coving, and other plaster shapes dimensions indicated on the plans.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

(4:30PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

3. 219 E HALEY ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-014

Zone: M-C

Application Number: PLN2016-00078
Owner: Price Living Trust

Applicant: Ed De Vicente, Architect

(Proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The proposal includes the demolition of seven existing structures housing eight residential units and the construction of a four-story, 35 unit, mixed-use development. Unit mix will include 14 two-bedroom units, 16 one-bedroom units, and 5 studios ranging in size from 412 to 1,011 square feet, with an average unit size of 719 square feet. Also proposed are two commercial spaces totaling 1,816 square feet. The proposed density on this 25,541 square foot parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial Industrial/Medium High Residential, 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 35 covered parking spaces for the residential units and 5 covered parking spaces for the commercial area, with 38 spaces required. Planning Commission review is required.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on March 25, 2019.

Item postponed two weeks due to an error in the project description.

* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:53 TO 5:33 P.M. *

(5:45PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 1964 LAS CANOAS RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-010-028

Zone: RS-1A

Application Number: PLN2019-00426

Owner: P3 Santa Barbara LLC

Applicant: Heidi Jones

(Proposal for a new water pump enclosure. Project entails replacing the existing domestic water and fire sprinkler water supply lines, replacement of existing domestic water pump within the existing pump house, and construction of a new water pump enclosure. Also proposed is landscaping, irrigation, and grading.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to his firm representing the project.

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, Applicant, SEPPS; Martha Degasis, Arcadia Studio; and Robert Schmidt,

Principal Engineer

Public comment opened at 5:42 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

- 1. The Board appreciates the project, particularly the grading and proposed mounding to screen the water pump element.
- 2. The landscaping is appropriate. The addition of landscaping near the driveway and entrance is appreciated.
- 3. The Board believes the project is ready for Project Design Approval.
- 4. The Board finds the proposed color acceptable but would prefer a darker color.

Action: Moore/Six, 5/0/0. (Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:00 TO 6:40 P.M. *

(6:40PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5. 15 S ALISOS ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-172-018

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PLN2019-00339

Owner: Three J. Investment Alisos LLC

Applicant: Michael Holliday

(Proposal for a new permanent supportive housing project administered through the Salvation Army. The project consists of the construction of a 2,767 square foot, 10 bedroom manufactured housing facility to match the materials, design and finishes of the existing adjacent structures. A wooden deck

on the west side of the new building will provide ADA ramp compliant access to new structure. The driveway area behind the existing home will be modified to accommodate an ADA van parking space and three standard parking spaces. New landscaping and site drainage are also proposed.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Actual time: 6:35 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Applicant, DMHA; Mark Gisler, Executive Director, The Salvation Army

<u>Staff comments:</u> Ms. Ostrenger clarified that the Board will be reviewing the design of the project and that no land-use decisions will be made at this hearing. She asked that the members of the public limit their comments to the design only.

Ms. Unzueta stated Concept Review is the initial step in the review process. Once the Board determines that the project is ready for a decision, the project will need to return before the Board for Project Design Approval and then Final Approval. There will be additional public hearings regarding this project.

Public comment opened at 7:02 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

- 1. Robin Unander, opposed. Pitzer Wituz, Natalie Govoni, Hortencia Gutierrez, Virginia R. White, and Bennie White ceded time to Ms. Unander.
- 2. Solveig Chandler, opposed.
- 3. Jason Dominguez
- 4. Chris Chandler, opposed. Victoria Chandler ceded time to Mr. Chandler.
- 5. Sebastian Aldana, opposed.
- 6. Kathryn D. Clarke, opposed.
- 7. Denise Adams
- 8. Pamela L. Flynt Tambo
- 9. Pedro Lopez, opposed.
- 10. Nicholas Jacobs, opposed.
- 11. Jose Arturo Gallegos, opposed. Christine Osani ceded time to Mr. Gallegos.
- 12. Lorna J. Boyd, opposed.
- 13. Robert Frank Zimels, opposed.
- 14. Rose Aldana. Sandy Cornejo ceded time to Ms. Aldana.
- 15. Natasha Todorovic, opposed.
- 16. Anna Marie Gott. Peter Dal Bello, Angelin Castagnola, and Lorna Boyd ceded time to Ms. Gott.
- 17. Rosario Alfaro
- 18. Patricia Lopez, opposed.

Written correspondence from Angelin Castagnola, Anna Marie Gott, Ben White, Bob Zimels, Chris Chandler, Christine Pardo & Ron van Der Leeden, Jessie Simmons, Joan Lochtefeld, Kathryn D. Clarke, Lauren Lochtefeld, Lisa Garza, Mary Robles, Blanton Myles, Nicholas Jacobs, Pamela Boehr, Piper Olhiser, Robert Modlin, Robin Unander, Sabrina White Clark, Sandra Vicencio, Sharon Byrne, Solveig Chandler, Victoria Chandler, Victoria Valente, Pedro Lopez, and Rob Guzzon were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:57 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Provide separate pedestrian access through the site.

2. Provide open space use and develop truly useful space for the residents.

3. Project shall provide an architectural design more compatible with the front unit.

4. The design shall be site specific, so that the outdoor and interior spaces are connected.

5. Provide lighting, gates, and fences.

6. Provide a conceptual landscape plan.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/1/0. (Watkins opposed) Motion carried.

<u>Individual comments:</u> Board Member Watkins stated that he is opposed because he would like to see more complex roof profiles in the project.

* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:40 P.M. *